

Ludington Area Schools  
Board of Education  
Meeting Minutes April 20, 2020

*This is a meeting of the Board of Education in public for the purpose of conducting the School District's business and is not to be considered a public community meeting. There is a time for public participation during the meeting as indicated on the agenda.*

Mission: Ludington Area School District, in partnership with parents and community, will educate and empower students to adapt and succeed in their future.

---

ELECTRONIC/VIRTUAL REGULAR MEETING

- I. Call to Order & Roll Call - The electronic/virtual meeting was called to order by Board President Carlson at 6:00 p.m. This meeting was held via Google Meet at the following access phone number: (US)+1 224-814-1306; Pin number: 331 650 903#. The Ludington Board of Education/Administration Office is located at 809 E. Tinkham Avenue, Ludington, Michigan, 49431.  
Members Present: Steve Carlson, Bret Autrey, Mike Nagle, Stephanie Reed, Josh Snyder, Leona Ashley, Scott Foster  
Members Absent: None
- II. Google Meet Participant Controls - Superintendent Jason Kennedy explained the electronic meeting controls for viewing participants.
- III. Agenda Modification – None to report.
- IV. Citizen Participation – Superintendent Jason Kennedy provided opportunity for public participation and reviewed Board Policy 0167.3 and protocol for participation. No public comment was heard.
- V. Consent Agenda
  - A. Ratification of Bill Payment Per Summary Dated April 20, 2020 was approved by consent.
    - General Operating Fund \$2,344,939.07
    - Athletic Fund \$2,786.23
    - Lunch Fund \$19,926.03
    - Total All Funds \$2,367,651.33
  - B. Approval of Minutes - Regular, Special, Closed Meetings March 16, 2020 were approved by consent.  
Motion by Autrey, supported by Nagle, to approve the consent agenda as presented. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.
- VI. Board Committee Reports
  - A. Stephanie Reed gave the Personnel Committee Report for April 15, 2020.
  - B. Josh Snyder gave the Finance Committee Report for April 16, 2020.
  - C. Mike Nagle gave the Building and Site Committee Report for April 17, 2020.
- VII. Superintendent's Report & Comments
  - A. Jason Kennedy gave an update on Letters of Agreement with Ludington Education Association and Ludington Educational Support Personnel Association. These were necessary to comply with the Governor's Executive Orders and to continue to receive State Aid payments, specifically pertaining to the requirement to pay school employees while implementing a Continuity of Learning Plan.
  - B. Mr. Kennedy gave an update on the Continuity of Learning Plans. All learning plan information and statements related to COVID-19 can be found on the district website.
- VIII. Discussion Items
  - A. Mr. Kennedy reviewed and discussed the Emergency Powers Resolution and why it is necessary. The Governor's Executive Order 2020-35 temporarily suspends and/or waives certain legal requirements for this school year. As a result, certain board policies are

Ludington Area Schools  
Board of Education  
Meeting Minutes April 20, 2020

affected; including policies related to curriculum and instruction, such as Policies 2220, 2231, 2521, and 2623; policies related to attendance, promotion, graduation, and grading requirements, such as Policies 5200, 5410, 5421, and 5460; policies addressing professional and administrative staff evaluations, such as Policies 1420 and 3220; and policies relating to school calendar, continuity of operations, and free and reduced price meals, such as Policy 8210, 8300, and 8531. This is a sample of policies that have been affected by Executive Order 2020-35. Boards are not required to amend every policy affected by the Executive Order. Boards may exercise the power granted under bylaw 0131.1 to adopt a resolution granting emergency powers to the Superintendent. These include the power to modify, alter, suspend, or otherwise address the need to vary from certain school policies for the remainder of this school year. These powers would remain in effect for the duration identified in Executive Order 2020-21 and Executive Order 2020-35 and any subsequent extension of those orders, unless otherwise rescinded or extended by the Board upon majority vote. Adoption of the resolution would grant emergency powers to the Superintendent so that each and every Board policy affected by the Executive Order does not have to be amended, only to be amended again after the expiration of the Executive Order. The Superintendent will ensure that the District complies with each Executive Order issued by the Governor through this pandemic, and this will be revisited each month at the regular Board meeting during this pandemic.

B. Mr. Kennedy reviewed the Bond Project Construction Schedule and Bid Package #3. He shared the state mandated shutdown of construction and site work activities on our elementary complex site will result in a delay in the timing of the District's occupancy of the new building. Based upon the now minimum six (6) week project delay, the Christman Company now projects that the cost of accelerating the work schedule to ensure an August 2021 occupancy to be between \$500,000 and \$1 million dollars. The Christman Company has recommended that the District adopt a completion date of November 15, 2021 so that this date can be communicated to bidder's in the final bid package for the elementary school project. The Christman Company believes that this is a safe position for the District to be in so that we are not overpromising to the community, while also not incurring a significant cost to accelerate the work schedule. This is based on:

- Uncertainty as to when we will actually return to work full speed; Helping to avoid trade contractor overlapping commitments during the re-start period.
- Not over-promising and disappointing the community, while also realizing the great opportunity to potentially receive better and lower bids that do not require a critical August completion.
- The ability to review this decision when we know more and move it up to deliver positive news.
- The uncertainty of whether there would be trade labor available for project acceleration.

Mr. Kennedy shared that the Christman Company does recommend that we request overtime premium hourly rates on the bid form from each bidder for the final bid package. They have also considered other options such as bidding an accelerated schedule as an alternate. For now, we will move forward with a November 15, 2021 occupancy date. If we are able to accelerate the project without incurring significant costs to do so, we will work towards this; however, it is recommended that this new occupancy date be the target.

C. Mr. Kennedy reviewed and discussed the Technology Bids submitted from four vendors for technology needs, including UPS equipment, network switches, and other

Ludington Area Schools  
Board of Education  
Meeting Minutes April 20, 2020

wireless components that support our wifi network. These purchases were already built into the elementary school construction project budget, but because we have access to a federal grant called E-Rate, we can purchase this technology at 20% of cost, and have the other 80% funded from the grant. This provides a savings of \$331,600 on the total project cost of \$414,500.63. Vector Tech is a company that we work with regularly, and Ruckus Network and Wireless Equipment is only offered by Vector Tech of those that submitted bids. The summary chart is as follows:

Bidder Name	Section 26 33 53 UPS Units	Section 27 21 19 Network Electronics	Section 27 21 33 Wireless Networks	Bid Total	Notes:
Sentinel	\$28,935.00				
Trace3	\$31,610.43	\$471,908.25	\$150,262.20	<b>\$653,780.88</b>	Meraki
VectorTech	\$27,857.69	\$213,639.23	\$138,927.11	<b>\$380,424.03</b>	Ruckus
Moss	\$34,335.05	\$288,393.21	\$121,285.79	<b>\$444,014.05</b>	Aruba/HP

The difference in the project total being recommended for approval from the original base bid amount is the acceptance of several alternates by the District. The alternate breakdown is listed on a worksheet below that was used to calculate the project total. The main difference is the addition of 5 year warranties in the three bid categories. In addition to that, there is also the acceptance of an alternate for a second power supply in 50% of the provided network equipment. This is to support all of the new network attached devices that will be installed in the new elementary school and renovated HS/MS (speakers, clocks, door access, wireless access points etc.), which will all require power from the network switches.

<b>Vector Tech Group Alternate Breakdown</b>		
Original Base Bid Amount Wireless	\$138,927.11	\$138,927.11
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$17,417.40	\$17,417.40
Onsite Controller Vs. Virtual	-\$7,196.35	
<b>Wireless Equipment Total</b>		<b>\$156,344.51</b>
Original Base Bid Amount Network	\$213,639.23	\$213,639.23
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$1,495.10	\$1,495.10
Alternate Optics	-\$8,821.37	
All Edge switches with 2nd power supply	\$24,664.50	
1/2 edge switches with 2nd power supply	\$12,332.25	\$12,332.25
Redundant Building Links	\$6,000.00	
Support Edge Switches 3 year	\$21,869.19	
Support Edge Switches 5 year	\$36,448.65	
<b>Network Equipment Total</b>		<b>\$227,466.58</b>
Original Base Bid Amount UPS	\$27,857.69	\$27,857.69
5 Year Warranty Alternate	\$2,831.85	\$2,831.85
<b>UPS Equipment Total</b>		<b>\$30,689.54</b>
<b>Project Total</b>		<b>\$414,500.63</b>

Ludington Area Schools  
Board of Education  
Meeting Minutes April 20, 2020

D. Mr. Kennedy reviewed the Underground Plumbing Bid Award - Bid Package #2. The Christman Company has received bids for Work Category 27A. Bids for the category were received, publicly opened on April 14, 2020 at 3:00 pm, and reviewed by the project team members via an online conference call. Following the opening of the bids, representatives from the Christman Company, GMB Architecture + Engineering, and the District conducted a formal post bid interview with the low responsive bidder. The Christman Company then completed a review of the company's financial records, completed the appropriate background and work history checks, reviewed each company's EMR rating by their insurance company, and reviewed the safety records for each company. The Christman Company used this information to make a bid award recommendation to the District. The Christman Company is seeking concurrence from the District on the company's recommendation for contract award for Work Category 27A prior to making an award. This recommendation represents the firm that The Christman Company believes provided the lowest, qualified, responsive bid for the Work Category, after reviewing all proposals, verifying qualifications and financial stability, conducting a post-bid interview with the bidder, and making any appropriate adjustments to pricing.

E. Mr. Kennedy discussed the Material Testing Bid Award recommendations and budget. Scott Foster had questions regarding the number of material tests. Discussion was held on the need for additional testing. It was recommended to include in the award an allowance of up to 40 additional material tests should they be needed at a cost up to and not exceeding \$3,900 that the Superintendent may authorize and execute.

IX. Action Items (Via Roll Call Vote)

A. Emergency Powers Resolution - Motion by Snyder, supported by Autrey to approve the Emergency Powers Resolution as written and presented. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.

B. Technology Bid Awards - Motion by Ashley, supported by Nagle, to approve a contract with Vectortech of Holland, Michigan in the amount of \$414,500.63 for UPS equipment including 5-year warranty alternate, Network Electronics including 5-year warranty alternate and 50% additional edge switch power supplies and Wireless equipment including 5 year warranty alternate to be paid with funds from the 2019 bond proceeds. Contingent upon approval of year 2020 eRate funding as presented. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.

C. Underground Plumbing Bid Award - Package #2 - Motion by Foster, supported by Autrey, to approve the award of a trade contract for work category 27A (underground plumbing) to the lowest, qualified, responsive bidder, Andy Eagen DBA Pressures and Pipes, as recommended by The Christman Company, in the amount of \$302,400 and to authorize the superintendent to sign and execute the trade contract between the District and Andy Eagen DBA Pressures and Pipes. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.

D. Material Testing Bid Award - Motion by Autrey, supported by Reed, to approve the award of a trade contract for materials testing to the qualified, responsive bidder, Soils and Structures, as recommended by The Christman Company, in the amount of \$45,000 and to authorize the superintendent to sign and execute the trade contract between the District and Soils and Structures with an added authorization to include 40 extra material tests at a cost up to and not exceeding \$3,900 that the Superintendent may authorize and execute if needed. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.

Ludington Area Schools  
Board of Education  
Meeting Minutes April 20, 2020

- X. Other Items of Business and Announcements ~ Jason Kennedy gave an update on the WSESD General Fund Budget presentation schedule. We will review their budget at our May Board Meeting; Vote to approve or disapprove by June 1, 2020.
- XI. Adjournment - Motion by Autrey, supported by Nagle, to adjourn the meeting at 7:09 p.m. Roll Call Vote: Ayes: Carlson, Autrey, Nagle, Reed, Snyder, Ashley, Foster. Nays: None. Motion: Carries 7-0.

---

Michael W. Nagle, Secretary, Board of Education

Approved \_\_\_\_\_

---

(Official minutes of the Ludington Board of Education are available for public inspection during normal business hours at the Board of Education's central business office, 809 E. Tinkham Avenue, Ludington, Michigan. Phone 231-845-7303.) *The Ludington Area School District is an equal opportunity employer and provider.*